

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, December 17, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Kyla Smith (KS), Vice Chair; Jerry D’Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Nate Lewis (NL); Wood Turner (WT); Logan Petrey (LP); Kim Huseman (KH); Mindee Jeffery (MJ) - observer

Absent: Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Mirenda (JM); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review December 3, 2024 notes
- L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL)
- 2027 Sunset: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (KH)
- 2027 Sunset: Sodium hydroxide (NL)
- 2027 Sunset: Cornstarch (native) (CD) - TR Sufficiency
- Fish oil - CAS number correction (DN)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 3, 2024 notes** were accepted as written
- **L-malic acid reclassification (NL).** The HS presented a proposal at the Fall 2024 meeting and voted to send it back for more work. The intent is to bring it to the Spring 2025 meeting as a discussion document and then perhaps a proposal for Fall 2025. The lead described the issue they are trying to solve. L-Malic acid is listed as 205.605(a) as a nonsynthetic when most of the L-Malic in use is synthetic, and therefore should also be listed at 205.605(b) to align with the current practices. Members shared feedback about the content of the draft document, and discussed commercial availability. The HS added questions for stakeholders. The lead will modify the draft and make the agreed upon changes and the HS will vote on a future call.
- **2027 Sunset: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (KH).** Calcium phosphates have many uses in organic products. The group discussed phosphates in general and noted that the NOSB recently reviewed and denied a petition to expand the use of potassium phosphate. A member suggested adding questions to stakeholders regarding an annotation to limit it to the “made with organic” category. The lead summarized the review, and the HS will submit this for the Spring 2025 meeting.
- **2027 Sunset: Sodium hydroxide (NL).** The lead noted the many uses, alternatives, and environmental concerns of sodium hydroxide. The HS will submit the final review for the Spring 2025 meeting.
- **2027 Sunset: Cornstarch (native) (CD) - TR Sufficiency.** The lead found the TR comprehensive however, the HS will seek clarification related to two statements, and ask for copyediting. The first question is about the quality of organic corn for use in cornstarch and that it does not meet the specifications that some manufacturers require, and the “inability of processors to make organic cornstarch on a commercial scale without the use of prohibited materials”. The HS will also add questions to stakeholders asking for feedback about the idea that organic corn is not suitable.
- **Fish oil - CAS number correction (DN).** Deferred to future call.
- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

December 3, 2024

2027 Sunset: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CD)
2027 Sunset: Glycerin (CD)
2027 Sunset: Cornstarch (native) (CD)
2027 Sunset: Waxes - nonsynthetic (wood rosin) (LP)
2027 Sunset: Carnauba wax (LP)

December 17, 2024

2027 Sunset: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (KH)
2027 Sunset: Sodium hydroxide (NL)
L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL)

January 7, 2025

Research Priorities (All) - due to MS by 1.9.25
2027 Sunset: Sodium bicarbonate (DN). Discuss review and TR sufficiency
2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)
2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN)
Ethylene - Annotation change (NL)
L-malic acid reclassification (AJ/NL)
Fish oil - CAS number correction (DN)

January 21, 2025

2027 Sunset: Ozone (JD). Discuss review and TR sufficiency
2027 Sunset: Kaolin (WT). Discuss review and TR sufficiency

February 4, 2025

February 18, 2025

March 4, 2025

March 18, 2025

April 1, 2025

April 15, 2025

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Ethylene - Annotation change to expand use	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR. TR due mid Aug 2024. TR sent to HS 8.19.24. Sufficiency due 10.18.24. TR found sufficient 9.17.24	11.19.24 1.7.25	Spr 2025

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification proposal	AJ/NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. 2019 TR	12.17.24 1.7.25	Spr 2025
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2025 list due to MS by January 9, 2025	1.7.25	Spr 2025
Fish oil - CAS number correction	DN	Added to work agenda 12.3.24, based on comments from stakeholder at Fall 2024 NOSB meeting.	1.7.25	Spr 2025

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec 2024. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25	1.21.25	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Dec 2024. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25	1.7.25	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew Tech correction: 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	12.3.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammon)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027	11.19.24 1.7.25	" "

			ium bicarbonat e, and Ammonium carbonate	TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.		
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonat e, and Ammonium carbonate	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.	11.19.24 1.7.25	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.17.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	11.19.24	" "
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2025. TR sent to HS 12.18.24. Sufficiency due 2.16.25	1.21.25	" "
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.17.24	" "
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	" "

Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	9.17.24	“ “
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	9.17.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew	12.3.24 12.17.24	“ “

				08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Nov 2024. TR sent to HS 12.6.24. TR suff due 2.4.25. TR found insufficient 12.17.24. HS sent additional questions to TR writer.		
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	" "
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	12.3.24	" "
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	11.19.24	" "

Spring 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Jan 24, 2025	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2025 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2025	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2025 proposals due to NOP	Feb 13, 2025	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2025	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 2, 2025	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2025	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 22 & 24, 2025	1
Spring 2025 NOSB meeting - Tempe, AZ	Apr 29 - May 1, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2025	30 days post meeting

Fall 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 15, 2025	24
NOP - Draft Fall 2025 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 8, 2025	~11

NOSB - Fall 2025 proposals due to NOP	Aug 20, 2025	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Sept 9, 2025	~8
Public comment closes	Oct 8, 2025	~4
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 14, 2025	~3
Public comment webinars	Oct 28 & 30, 2025	1
Fall 2025 NOSB meeting - Omaha, NE	Nov 4 - 6, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 28, 2025	~30 days post

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, December 3, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Kyla Smith (KS), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Nate Lewis (NL); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Wood Turner (WT); Logan Petrey (LP); Mindee Jeffery (MJ) - observer

Absent: Kim Huseman (KH)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Mirenda (JM)

Agenda

- Review November 19, 2024 notes
- 2027 Sunset: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CD)
- 2027 Sunset: Glycerin (CD)
- 2027 Sunset: Cornstarch (native) (CD)
- 2027 Sunset: Waxes - nonsynthetic (wood resin) (LP)
- 2027 Sunset: Carnauba wax (LP)
- Additional items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **November 19, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Review schedule.**
 - **Reminder:** Please circulate draft reviews early, and prior to next HS call so members have time to read them before the calls.
 - **L Malic acid proposal status.** The previous proposal was returned to Subcommittee for additional refinement. The HS is working on another iteration, which is viewed as a correction to the classification. Members encouraged the addition of a comprehensive history from previous work and public comments.
 - **Fish oil CAS number.** The HS received a comment about an incorrect CAS number, and plan to write a proposal to make a technical correction.
- **2027 Sunset: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CD).** The lead summarized the uses of inulin oligofructose enriched, and noted it's found in a wide variety of foods. The last time it was reviewed there were mixed comments, and some concerns about commercial availability, but ultimately there was support for relisting. The HS added questions consistent with the other 205.606 substances.
- **2027 Sunset: Glycerin (CD).** The lead briefly summarized the review for glycerin, including uses and international standards, and will finalize the document for the Spring meeting.
- **2027 Sunset: Cornstarch (native) (CD).** The lead summarized the uses of cornstarch, and noted that the HS is waiting for a TR. The last TAP was done in 1995. Members discussed the supply of organic cornstarch. NOP will confirm the status of the TR.
- **2027 Sunset: Waxes - nonsynthetic (wood resin) (LP).** The lead summarized the review for wood rosin and the group discussed the recent technical correction as well as environmental issues surrounding reforestation of the source wood. The HS added a question to the review about third-party certification.
- **2027 Sunset: Carnauba wax (LP).** The lead summarized the review including uses, international acceptance, ancillary substances and human health/environmental issues. A member commented on the use of the (Generally Regarded as Safe) GRAS designation.
- **Additional items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

November 19, 2024

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN) - TR sufficiency (due 12.2.24)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN) - TR sufficiency (due 12.2.24)

2027 Sunset: Low-acyl gellan gum (KS)

2027 Sunset: Orange shellac (KS)

2027 Sunset: Sodium hydroxide (NL)

December 3, 2024

2027 Sunset: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CD)

2027 Sunset: Glycerin (CD)

2027 Sunset: Cornstarch (native) (CD)

2027 Sunset: Waxes - nonsynthetic (wood rosin) (LP)

2027 Sunset: Carnauba wax (LP)

December 17, 2024

2027 Sunset: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (KH)

2027 Sunset: Sodium hydroxide (NL)

Ethylene - Annotation change (NL)

L-malic acid reclassification (NL)

Fish oil - CAS number correction (DN)

January 7, 2025

2027 Sunset: Sodium bicarbonate (DN)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN)

January 21, 2025

2027 Sunset: Ozone (JD)

2027 Sunset: Kaolin (WT)

February 4, 2025

February 18, 2025

March 4, 2025

March 18, 2025

April 1, 2025

April 15, 2025

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Ethylene - Annotation change to expand use	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR. TR due mid Aug 2024. TR sent to HS 8.19.24. Sufficiency due 10.18.24. TR found sufficient 9.17.24	11.19.24 12.17.24	Spr 2025

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification proposal	NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. Proposal 2019 TR	12.17.24	Spr 2025
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2025 list due to MS by January 17, 2025	TBD	Spr 2025
Fish oil - CAS number correction	DN	Added to work agenda 12.3.24, based on comments from stakeholder at Fall 2024 NOSB meeting.	12.17.24	Spr 2025

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec 2024	4.16.24 5.21.24 1.21.25	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Dec 2024	4.16.24 1.7.25	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood rosin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew Tech correction: 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24 12.3.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.	4.16.24 11.19.24 1.7.25	" "

Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.	4.16.24 11.19.24 1.7.25	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24 12.17.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24 11.19.24	" "
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2025	4.2.24 1.21.25	" "
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 12.17.24	" "
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24 12.3.24	" "
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	" "
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24 9.17.24	" "

Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Nov 2024.	4.2.24 12.3.24	“ “
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 12.3.24	“ “

Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 12.3.24	“ “
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 11.19.24	“ “

Spring 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Jan 24, 2025	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2025 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2025	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2025 proposals due to NOP	Feb 13, 2025	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2025	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 2, 2025	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2025	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 22 & 24, 2025	1
Spring 2025 NOSB meeting - Tempe, AZ	Apr 29 - May 1, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2025	30 days post meeting

Fall 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 15, 2025	24
NOP - Draft Fall 2025 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 8, 2025	~11
NOSB - Fall 2025 proposals due to NOP	Aug 20, 2025	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Sept 9, 2025	~8
Public comment closes	Oct 8, 2025	~4
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 14, 2025	~3
Public comment webinars	Oct 28 & 30, 2025	1
Fall 2025 NOSB meeting - Omaha, NE	Nov 4 - 6, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 28, 2025	~30 days post

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, November 19, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Kyla Smith (KS), Vice Chair; Jerry D’Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kim Huseman (KH); Nate Lewis (NL); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Wood Turner (WT)

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP); Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK)

Staff: Jo Mirenda (JM)

Agenda

- Review October 1, 2024 notes
- Discussion/reflections from Portland
- TR sufficiency: Ammonium bicarbonate and Ammonium carbonate
- 2027 Sunset: Low-acyl gellan gum
- 2027 Sunset: Orange shellac
- 2027 Sunset: Sodium hydroxide
- Ethylene annotation change petition
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **October 1, 2024 notes** were approved.
- **Discussion/reflections from Portland** – Appreciate the Handling Subcommittee making it through many sunset reviews in record time. Still some interest in trying a consent agenda in the future, particularly for Handling materials since there are so many. There was a lot of discussion and focus on commercial availability at the fall meeting, related to Handling materials on 205.606 as well as other aspects of the regulations, such as seed. Members discussed the challenges of measuring commercial availability, and the lack of hard data to rely on to make decisions. Members also discussed status of the Materials Subcommittee’s work agenda related to comprehensive review of sanitizers.
- **TR sufficiency: Ammonium bicarbonate and Ammonium carbonate** – The TR was determined to be sufficient.
- **2027 Sunset: Low-acyl gellan gum** – The lead provided an overview and members discussed the history of the annotation changes for this listing. The last TR on gums was done before there was a distinction between high- and low- acyl gellan gum, and also didn’t directly cover ancillary substances in gums. This material is produced using the fermentation process. A member questioned if we have information about when/why the synthetic low-acyl is used in organic food compared to the nonsynthetic high-acyl form; this could be a question for public comments. Members may also ask for information about ancillary substances.
- **2027 Sunset: Orange shellac** – The lead provided an overview of the material which is used as a fruit coating. The last sunset review was a split vote due to lack of public comments about whether it is used. The subcommittee will add questions for public comment to get information needed to justify this listing. Some past comments wanted an annotation to require labels to disclose when it is used as a coating, but that is an FDA labeling issue and is outside of NOP’s jurisdiction.
- **2027 Sunset: Sodium hydroxide** – did not discuss; move to future meeting
- **Ethylene annotation change petition** – The petition under review is for expanding the allowance of ethylene for potatoes and onions, and a TR is in progress for those specific uses. There is interest from the potato and onion industry to use ethylene as an alternative to clove oil which poses harm to workers. In the past, the Board had rejected an allowance for using it in pears. The subcommittee is also discussing whether the existing annotation for “tropical fruit” needs any clarifications to ensure consistent enforcement.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

Previous HS Notes

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

October 1, 2024 - Allison out of office.

Fermentation.

Meeting prep/Written comments

October 15, 2024 - Cancelled. Conflicts with public comment webinar

November 5, 2024 - Cancelled. Election day.

November 19, 2024

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN) - TR sufficiency (due 12.2.24)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN) - TR sufficiency (due 12.2.24)

2027 Sunset: Low-acyl gellan gum (KS)

2027 Sunset: Orange shellac (KS)

2027 Sunset: Sodium hydroxide (NL)

December 3, 2024

2027 Sunset: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CD)

2027 Sunset: Glycerin (CD)

2027 Sunset: Cornstarch (native) (CD)

2027 Sunset: Waxes - nonsynthetic (wood resin) (LP)

2027 Sunset: Carnauba wax (LP)

December 17, 2024

2027 Sunset: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (KH)

January 7, 2025

2027 Sunset: Sodium bicarbonate (DN)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN)

January 21, 2025

2027 Sunset: Ozone (JD)

2027 Sunset: Kaolin (WT)

February 4, 2025

February 18, 2025

March 4, 2025

March 18, 2025

April 1, 2025

April 15, 2025

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Ethylene	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR. TR due mid Aug 2024. TR sent to HS 8.19.24. Sufficiency due 10.18.24. TR found sufficient 9.17.24		Spr 2025

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification proposal	NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. Proposal 2019 TR		Spr 2025
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2025 list due to MS by January 17, 2025		Spr 2025

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec 2024	4.16.24 5.21.24 1.21.25	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Dec 2024	4.16.24 1.7.25	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew Tech correction: 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24 12.3.24	" "

Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.	4.16.24 11.19.24 1.7.25	" "
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24. TR found sufficient 11.19.24.	4.16.24 11.19.24 1.7.25	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24 12.17.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24 11.19.24	" "
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2025	4.2.24 1.21.25	" "
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 12.3.24	" "
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24 12.3.24	" "

Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “

Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Nov 2024	4.2.24 12.3.24	" "
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 12.3.24	" "
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 12.3.24	" "
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 11.19.24	" "

Spring 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Dec 6, 2024	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2025 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 7, 2025	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2025 proposals due to NOP	Feb 13, 2025	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 3, 2025	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 2, 2025	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2025	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 22 & 24, 2025	1
Spring 2025 NOSB meeting - Tempe, AZ	Apr 29 - May 1, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2025	30 days post meeting

Fall 2025 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 15, 2025	24
NOP - Draft Fall 2025 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 8, 2025	~11
NOSB - Fall 2025 proposals due to NOP	Aug 20, 2025	~9

NOP - Post proposals	Sept 9, 2025	~8
Public comment closes	Oct 8, 2025	~4
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Oct 14, 2025	~3
Public comment webinars	Oct 28 & 30, 2025	1
Fall 2025 NOSB meeting - Omaha, NE	Nov 4 - 6, 2025	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 28, 2025	~30 days post

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, October 1, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Wood Turner (WT); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Kim Huseman (KH)

Absent: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Logan Petrey (LP)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Mirenda (JM); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- September 17, 2024 notes
- Fermentation (NL)
- Meeting prep/Written comments
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **September 17, 2024 notes** were approved as written
- **Fermentation (NL).** The group discussed a potential project on fermentation. The Executive team has had preliminary discussions to try to scope and frame the issue. Most often the issues are ambiguity around the classification of synthetic vs. non-synthetic, agricultural vs. non-agricultural, and/or GMO vs. non-GMO. Members felt that the NOSB should focus on the classification issue. The group members exchanged ideas and questions about fermentation such as, “how far back in the process does one look when reviewing”, “how many total sunsets would this include”, “what is the end goal”, “what does success look like”, and what is the timeframe for this project? Members discussed other aspects such as the definition of fermentation, connection to excluded methods, needs from the community, and affidavits. A member noted that Certifiers haven’t expressed any difficulties, and that most follow the ACA best practices which are clear.
- **Meeting prep/Written comments.** The Food Technologist is analyzing written comments, and the NOP will have the non-sunset ones bundled and sent to the NOSB by the end of the week, and the sunset summaries completed by October 11.
- **Review process for discussing sunsets at the Fall NOSB meeting.** The NOSB has come up with a strategy for delivering sunset reviews at NOSB meetings, to save time. The goals are efficiency, conciseness, consistency, and comprehensiveness. The Board wants to be cognizant of honoring the previous work done by the Board and by commenters, while also saving time at the meetings. Points to include when summarizing a sunset: name of substance, reference, status at previous review, public comment summary, Subcommittee recommendation, and vote. The NOSB Chair noted that she will mention the concept at the start of the NOSB meeting, so stakeholders know. A member suggested that each member provide an opening statement to indicate that they will be providing a brief summary.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

September 17, 2024

2027 Sunset: Colors (AJ)

Ethylene (NL) - TR sufficiency due Oct 18

October 1, 2024 - Allison out of office.

Fermentation.

Meeting prep/Written comments

October 15, 2024 - Cancelled. Conflicts with public comment webinar

November 5, 2024 - Cancelled. Election day.

November 19, 2024

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN) - TR sufficiency (due 12.2.24)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN) - TR sufficiency (due 12.2.24)

2027 Sunset: Low-acyl gellan gum (KS)

2027 Sunset: Orange shellac (KS)

2027 Sunset: Sodium hydroxide (NL)

December 3, 2024

2027 Sunset: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CD)

2027 Sunset: Glycerin (CD)

2027 Sunset: Cornstarch (native) (CD)

2027 Sunset: Waxes - nonsynthetic (wood resin) (LP)

2027 Sunset: Carnauba wax (LP)

December 17, 2024

2027 Sunset: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (KH)

January 7, 2025

2027 Sunset: Sodium bicarbonate (DN)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN)

January 21, 2025

2027 Sunset: Ozone (JD)

2027 Sunset: Kaolin (WT)

February 4, 2025

February 18, 2025

March 4, 2025

March 18, 2025

April 1, 2025

April 15, 2025

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Ethylene	205.605	NL	Discussion document	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR. TR due mid Aug 2024. TR sent to HS 8.19.24. Sufficiency due 10.18.24. TR found sufficient 9.17.24	8.6.24 9.17.24	Fall 2024

Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation Petition addendum	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	2016 TR Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24. Petition found insufficient. Sent petition back for additional information 4.2.24. Petition addendum sent to HS 5.22.24. Petition sufficiency due ~ 7.22.24. petitioned found sufficient 7.2.24. No new TR requested.	3.19.24 4.2.24 6.4.24 7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
---	------------	----	----------	--	---	-----------

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 6.4.24 7.16.24	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.23.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermentd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	7.16.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to	6.18.24	" "

				HS 3.19.24. Sufficiency due ASAP. TR found sufficient 4.2.24.		
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	“ “
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	7.23.24	“ “
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	“ “
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.23.24	“ “
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.2.24	“ “
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.2.24	“ “

Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	" "
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	7.23.24	" "
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	" "
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	" "
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.23.24	" "
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	" "
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	" "
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	" "

Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	6.18.24	“ “
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24 7.16.24	“ “
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “

Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	“ “
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	-------------	--------	-------------------	----------------

Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec 2024	4.16.24 5.21.24 1.21.25	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Dec 2024	4.16.24 1.7.25	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew Tech correction: 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24 12.3.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24	4.16.24 11.19.24 1.7.25	" "
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024. TR sent to HS 10.3.24. Suff due 12.2.24	4.16.24 11.19.24 1.7.25	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24 12.17.24	" "

Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24 11.19.24	“ “
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2025	4.2.24 1.21.25	“ “
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 11.19.24	“ “
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24 12.3.24	“ “
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “

Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Nov 2024	4.2.24 12.3.24	“ “
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 11.5.24	“ “
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 11.5.24	“ “
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 11.19.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, September 17, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Wood Turner (WT); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Logan Petrey (LP); Mindee Jeffery (MJ) - observer

Absent: Kim Huseman (KH)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Mirenda (JM); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- September 3, 2024 notes
- 2027 Sunset: Colors (AJ)
- Ethylene TR sufficiency
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **September 3, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Sunset discussion schedule.** The group reviewed the discussion schedule, and chose to cancel the November 5 call since it falls on election day.
- **2027 Sunset: Colors (AJ).** The lead noted that the NOSB member who reviewed the colors last time is still currently on the Board and the Handling Subcommittee. The lead summarized the draft reviews, and the group discussed several of the substances. At the last sunset review the NOSB voted to remove eight (8) colors, and recommended that the next board look at other potential candidates. Considerations include organic alternatives, colors used to replace those lost in the manufacturing process, and commercial availability. The group also talked about the inclusion of International Standards, the standards that are not currently listed (such as Taiwan and the UK), and agreed on the questions to stakeholders. The lead will finalize and submit for Spring 2025 meeting.
- **2027 Sunset: Ethylene Discussion Document (NL) - TR sufficiency due Oct 18.** The lead summarized the petition, which requests an expansion of the use of ethylene to allow use in potato and onion storage. Since the TR was received late, The HS developed a discussion document for the Fall 2024 meeting, while waiting for the TR to arrive. The TR is now available, and the HS found it comprehensive and sufficient. The HS Chair will relay that information to the NOP so the TR can get posted.
- **Additional Items.**
 - A member asked about the Fall 2024 proposal on L-Malic Acid, to verify that there is consistency across documents and scopes.
 - The NOSB Vice Chair sent a proposed template for presenting sunsets at the Fall meeting. In an effort to save time, each member will give a brief synopsis of each material. The NOSB will discuss this again before NOSB meeting.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

2027 Sunset: Colors (AJ)

Ethylene (NL) - TR sufficiency due Oct 18

October 1, 2024 - Allison out of office.

Fermentation.

Meeting prep/Written comments

October 15, 2024 - Cancelled. Conflicts with public comment webinar

November 5, 2024 - Cancelled. Election day.

November 19, 2024

2027 Sunset: Low-acyl gellan gum (KS)

2027 Sunset: Orange shellac (KS)

2027 Sunset: Sodium hydroxide (NL)

December 3, 2024

2027 Sunset: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CD)

2027 Sunset: Glycerin (CD)

2027 Sunset: Cornstarch (native) (CD)

2027 Sunset: Waxes - nonsynthetic (wood resin) (LP)

2027 Sunset: Carnauba wax (LP)

December 17, 2024

2027 Sunset: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (KH)

January 7, 2025

2027 Sunset: Sodium bicarbonate (DN)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN)

January 21, 2025

2027 Sunset: Ozone (JD)

2027 Sunset: Kaolin (WT)

February 4, 2025

February 18, 2025

March 4, 2025

March 18, 2025

April 1, 2025

April 15, 2025

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Ethylene	205.605	NL	Discussion document	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR. TR due mid Aug 2024. TR sent to HS 8.19.24. Sufficiency due 10.18.24. TR found sufficient 9.17.24	8.6.24 9.17.24	Fall 2024

Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation Petition addendum	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	2016 TR Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24. Petition found insufficient. Sent petition back for additional information 4.2.24. Petition addendum sent to HS 5.22.24. Petition sufficiency due ~ 7.22.24. petitioned found sufficient 7.2.24. No new TR requested.	3.19.24 4.2.24 6.4.24 7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
---	------------	----	----------	--	---	-----------

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 6.4.24 7.16.24	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.23.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermentd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	7.16.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to	6.18.24	" "

				HS 3.19.24. Sufficiency due ASAP. TR found sufficient 4.2.24.		
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	“ “
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	7.23.24	“ “
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	“ “
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.23.24	“ “
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.2.24	“ “
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.2.24	“ “

Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	" "
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	7.23.24	" "
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	" "
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	" "
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.23.24	" "
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	" "
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	" "
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	" "

Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	6.18.24	“ “
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24 7.16.24	“ “
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “

Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	“ “
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	-------------	--------	-------------------	----------------

Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec 2024	4.16.24 5.21.24 1.21.25	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Dec 2024	4.16.24 1.7.25	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew Tech correction: 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24 12.3.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024	4.16.24 1.7.25	" "
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024	4.16.24 1.7.25	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24 12.17.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24 11.19.24	" "

Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2025	4.2.24 1.21.25	“ “
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 11.19.24	“ “
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24 12.3.24	“ “
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “

Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Nov 2024	4.2.24 12.3.24	“ “
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 11.5.24	“ “
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 11.5.24	“ “
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 11.19.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, September 3, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH)

Absent: Dilip Nandwani (DN); Logan Petrey (LP); Jo Mirenda (JM)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- August 6, 2024 notes
- Review 2027 sunsets schedule
- Fish oil CAS numbers
- New work agenda items discussion
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **August 6, 2024 notes** were approved via email on August 20.
- **Review 2027 sunsets schedule.** The HS reviewed the work for the upcoming semester, and scheduled discussion dates for the 2027 sunsets. The NOP is working on the templates for the sunsets, and will let the HS know by the end of the week/early next week if the ones for the colors will be ready in time for the HS to discuss them on the September 17 call.
- **Fish oil CAS numbers.** A stakeholder reached out to an NOSB member regarding the CAS numbers for fish oil, as he believes they are incorrect. The stakeholder was directed to submit his concern as a public comment, and the NOSB will then review it. The NOP noted that the CAS numbers listed in the regulations pertain to two fatty acids, and not fish oil per se.
- **New work agenda items discussion.** The HS discussed fermentation. A member asked what problem they would be trying to solve, and whether it would make sense to have the Materials Subcommittee work on it instead of Handling. The fundamental issue is how far back in the manufacturing process to go and when does the materials classification decision tree start? A member added that it might be helpful to talk about commercial availability, and to shrink the list of substances on 205.606. The HS will discuss this again on the October 1 call.
- **Additional Items.**
 - The HS discussed the Food Technologists workload, especially during the run-up to the Fall meeting. In addition to several other projects, the NOSB has asked that she summarize the written public comments.
 - Schedule ethylene TR sufficiency
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

August 6, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Fish oil (DN)

Enzymes (JD)

Microorganisms (JD)

Yeast (JD)

Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - discuss/vote

Ethylene - petitioned annotation change discussion document (NL) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2024 - cancelled

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

2027 Sunset: Colors (AJ)

October 1, 2024

2027 Sunset: Ethylene (NL) - TR sufficiency due Oct 18

October 15, 2024 - (public comment webinar)

November 5, 2024

2027 Sunset: Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CD)

2027 Sunset: Glycerin (CD)

November 19, 2024

2027 Sunset: Low-acyl gellan gum (KS)

2027 Sunset: Orange shellac (KS)

2027 Sunset: Sodium hydroxide (NL)

December 3, 2024

2027 Sunset: Cornstarch (native) (CD)

2027 Sunset: Waxes - nonsynthetic (wood resin) (LP)

2027 Sunset: Carnauba wax (LP)

December 17, 2024

2027 Sunset: Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (KH)

January 7, 2025

2027 Sunset: Sodium bicarbonate (DN)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)

2027 Sunset: Ammonium carbonate (DN)

January 21, 2025

2027 Sunset: Ozone (JD)

2027 Sunset: Kaolin (WT)

February 4, 2025

February 18, 2025

March 4, 2025

March 18, 2025

April 1, 2025

April 15, 2025

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Ethylene	205.605	NL	Discussion document	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR. TR due mid Aug 2024. TR sent to HS 8.19.24. Sufficiency due 10.18.24	8.6.24 10.1.24	Fall 2024

Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation Petition addendum	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	2016 TR Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24. Petition found insufficient. Sent petition back for additional information 4.2.24. Petition addendum sent to HS 5.22.24. Petition sufficiency due ~ 7.22.24. petitioned found sufficient 7.2.24. No new TR requested.	3.19.24 4.2.24 6.4.24 7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024
---	------------	----	----------	---	---	-----------

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 6.4.24 7.16.24	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.23.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermentd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	7.16.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to	6.18.24	" "

				HS 3.19.24. Sufficiency due ASAP. TR found sufficient 4.2.24.		
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	“ “
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	7.23.24	“ “
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	“ “
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.23.24	“ “
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.2.24	“ “
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.2.24	“ “

Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	" "
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	7.23.24	" "
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	" "
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	" "
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.23.24	" "
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	" "
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	" "
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	" "

Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	6.18.24	“ “
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24 7.16.24	“ “
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “

Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	“ “
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	-------------	--------	-------------------	----------------

Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Dec 2024	4.16.24 5.21.24 1.21.25	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Dec 2024	4.16.24 1.7.25	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew Tech correction: 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24 12.3.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024	4.16.24 1.7.25	" "
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Sep 2024	4.16.24 1.7.25	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24 12.17.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24 11.19.24	" "

Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2025	4.2.24 1.21.25	" "
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 11.19.24	" "
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24 12.3.24	" "
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	" "
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24 9.17.24	" "
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	" "
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	" "
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	" "
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	" "
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	" "

Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 9.17.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Nov 2024	4.2.24 12.3.24	“ “
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 11.5.24	“ “
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 11.5.24	“ “
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24 11.19.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, August 6, 2024 12:00 pm ET

Present: Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Kyla Smith (KS); Wood Turner (WT); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Kim Huseman (KH)

Absent: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Logan Petrey (LP)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Mirenda (JM); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review July 23, 2024 notes
- 2026 sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Fish oil (DN)
 - Enzymes (JD)
 - Microorganisms (JD)
 - Yeast (JD)
- Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - discuss/vote
- Ethylene - petitioned annotation change discussion document (NL) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **July 23, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2026 sunsets - discuss/vote**

Fish oil (DN). The lead gave a brief overview of the draft document and focused on the discussion section. The document includes discussion of the 2021 NOSB recommendation. The NOSB Chair suggested reaching out to seek info about the previous recommendation, so they are not duplicating work that was not implemented by the NOP. The HS will include a question to stakeholders regarding future work on aquaculture.

Motion to remove fish oil from the National List

Motion by: DN

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 1 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD). The lead discussed all three substances in one, and the HS voted on each separately. The current iteration of the review includes new information, including a discussion of fermentation. The lead noted that collectively there are about 14 TRs/TAPs for the three substances. The lead will make some minor modifications based on today's conversation. The HS proceeded to the votes.

Motion to remove enzymes from the National List

Motion by: JD

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

Microorganisms (JD). See conversation above.

Motion to remove microorganisms from the National List

Motion by: JD

Seconded by: CD

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

Yeast (JD). See conversation above.

Motion to remove yeast from the National List

Motion by: JD

Seconded by: DN

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD).** The lead acknowledged the Food Technologist for her research support, and summarized the petition and proposal for the group. The petitioner is requesting an annotation change to (1) remove the restriction that potassium phosphate can only be used in products labeled 'made with organic ingredients' and (2) change "potassium phosphate" to "potassium phosphates,". The lead added that potassium phosphate is already on the National List, as well as many alternatives, and there are noted health concerns with accumulation of phosphates in the human diet. The HS is not supportive of the amendment, and voted to move the proposal to the full Board for discussion.

Classification Motion:

Potassium phosphate is already classified as synthetic and are on the National List for use in "made with" organic.

Motion to remove the annotation restricting use to 'made with organic ingredients' and to add an "s" to phosphate at 205.605(b)

Motion by: CD

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Ethylene - petitioned discussion document (NL).** The lead summarized the petition, which seeks an annotation change to expand use of ethylene gas to include sprouting inhibition on organic potatoes and onions. The HS requested a limited scope TR to look at human health and environmental concerns, and is awaiting that TR. The group discussed non-synthetic alternatives, uses, and stakeholders' interest in this expanded use. The HS posed three questions for stakeholders.

Motion to accept the discussion document to amend ethylene at 205.605

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 7 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

July 23, 2024 - Additional call 12:00 ET/9:00 PT

Calcium citrate (CD)

Potassium citrate (CD)

Sodium citrate (CD)

Magnesium sulfate (AJ)
 Ferrous sulfate (AJ)
 Nutrient vitamins and minerals (AJ)
 Perlite (KH)
 Activated charcoal (KH)
 Collagen gel (KH)
 Gelatin (KH)
 Research Priorities (All) - discuss/send to Materials

August 6, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Fish oil (DN)

Enzymes (JD)

Microorganisms (JD)

Yeast (JD)

Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - discuss/vote

Ethylene - petitioned annotation change discussion document (NL) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Ethylene	205.605	NL	Discussion document	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR.	8.6.24	Fall 2024
Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation Petition addendum	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	2016 TR Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24. Petition found insufficient. Sent petition back for additional information 4.2.24. Petition addendum sent to HS 5.22.24. Petition sufficiency due ~ 7.22.24. petitioned found sufficient 7.2.24. No new TR requested.	3.19.24 4.2.24 6.4.24 7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 6.4.24 7.16.24	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.23.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	7.16.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to HS 3.19.24. Sufficiency due ASAP. TR found sufficient 4.2.24.	6.18.24	" "
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	" "

L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	7.23.24	“ “
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	“ “
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.23.24	“ “
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.2.24	“ “
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.2.24	“ “
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	“ “

Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	7.23.24	“ “
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	“ “
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.23.24	“ “
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “

Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	" "
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	" "
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	" "
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	" "
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	6.18.24	" "
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24 7.16.24	" "
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	" "
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	" "

Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “

Milestones

NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025

Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24	" "
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	" "
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "

Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ ”
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24	“ ”
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”

Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes
Tuesday, July 23, 2024 12:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Logan Petrey (LP); Kim Huseman (KH); Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair

Absent: Kyla Smith (KS); Wood Turner (WT); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Mirenda (JM); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review notes: July 16, 2024
- 2026 sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Calcium citrate (CD)
 - Potassium citrate (CD)
 - Sodium citrate (CD)
 - Perlite (KH)
 - Activated charcoal (KH)
 - Collagen gel (KH)
 - Gelatin (KH)
 - Magnesium sulfate (AJ)
 - Ferrous sulfate (AJ)
 - Nutrient vitamins and minerals (AJ)
- Research Priorities (All) - discuss/send to Materials
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **July 16, 2024 notes** were approved as written.
- **2026 sunsets - discuss/vote**
 - **Calcium citrate (CD).** The lead briefly summarized the reviews for all three citrates, noting that salts - calcium citrate, potassium citrate and sodium citrate – are all derived from citric acid. There were no significant objections from commenters at the Spring meeting, and all or most were supportive of relisting.

Motion to remove calcium citrate from the National List

Motion by: CD

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 3

- **Potassium citrate (CD).** See discussion above.

Motion to remove potassium citrate from the National List

Motion by: CD

Seconded by: KH

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 3

- **Sodium citrate (CD).** See discussion above.

Motion to remove sodium citrate from the National List

Motion by: CD

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 3

- **Perlite (KH).** The lead summarized the use of perlite as a filtering aid, noting its compliance with OFPA. Public comments from the Spring meeting were supportive of relisting and the group moved to a vote.

Motion to remove perlite from the National List

Motion by: KH

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 3

- **Activated charcoal (KH).** The lead summarized the use of activated charcoal and the public comments from the Spring meeting. No controversy with the listing of this material.

Motion to remove activated charcoal from the National List

Motion by: KH

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 3

- **Collagen gel (KH).** The lead summarized the use of collagen gel, which is widely used. She also summarized the public comments from the Spring meeting. The HS didn't receive answers to the specific questions they asked in the Spring, however, commenters were overall supportive of relisting, although a couple mentioned needing more research on manufacturing. The group had a broader discussion about commercial availability and the thresholds used to determine that. Members suggested that as an economic research priority, or a great project for a student thesis or dissertation.

Motion to remove collagen gel from the National List at 205.605(b)

Motion by: KH

Seconded by: AJ

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 3

- **Gelatin (KH).** The lead summarized the use of gelatin and the public comments from the Spring meeting. The HS didn't receive answers to the specific questions they asked at the Spring meeting. She noted that gelatin is widely used, and commenters supported relisting.

Motion to remove gelatin from the National List

Motion by: KH

Seconded by: CD

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 3

- **Magnesium sulfate (AJ).** The lead summarized the use of magnesium sulfate, noting there are both synthetic and non-synthetic versions, although only the non-synthetic is allowed in organic. At the Spring meeting there was discussion about alternatives, however, the alternatives were not adequate as they changed the flavor of the product. Members and stakeholders were supportive of relisting.

Motion to remove magnesium sulfate from the National List

Motion by: AJ

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 3

- **Ferrous sulfate (AJ).** The lead briefly described the use of ferrous sulfate, which is commonly added to flours and cereal products to make an optional enriched claim and often found in baked products and infant snacks (oat cereal, teething biscuits, etc.). Iron is essential in human diets, and she noted the importance of taking the correct dose, as either a deficiency or excess can cause health issues.

Motion to remove ferrous sulfate from the National List

Motion by: AJ

Seconded by: KH

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 3

- **Nutrient vitamins and minerals (NVM) (AJ).** The lead summarized the history of the review of NVM highlighting the difference between a previous proposed annotation and the annotation that was implemented. The Board and NOP have considered various proposals to change this listing to align more closely with the NOSB's original recommendation, to address concerns about fortification of infant formula, and to consider nutrients that may fall in gray areas. Commenters indicated that certifiers may not be applying this evenly across operations, and there may be some confusion. The group discussed specific examples for context and moved to a vote.

Motion to remove nutrient vitamins and minerals from the National List

Motion by: AJ

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 6 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 3

- **Research Priorities (LP).** The lead introduced the draft list of Handling research priorities and the group discussed and agreed upon the final list to send to the Materials Subcommittee for the Fall meeting. Topics include sanitizers, expanding market opportunities, and research on celery powder.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

Previous HS Notes

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

July 16, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Celery powder (WT)

Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL)

Ascorbic acid (NL)

L-Malic acid (NL)

L-Malic acid reclassification (NL) - discuss/vote

July 23, 2024 - Additional call 12:00 ET/9:00 PT

Calcium citrate (CD)

Potassium citrate (CD)

Sodium citrate (CD)

Magnesium sulfate (AJ)

Ferrous sulfate (AJ)

Nutrient vitamins and minerals (AJ)

Perlite (KH)

Activated charcoal (KH)

Collagen gel (KH)

Gelatin (KH)

Research Priorities (All) - discuss/send to Materials

August 6, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Fish oil (DN)

Enzymes (JD)

Microorganisms (JD)

Yeast (JD)

Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - discuss/vote

Ethylene - petitioned annotation change discussion document (NL) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Ethylene	205.605	NL	Discussion document	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR.	8.6.24	Fall 2024
Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation Petition addendum	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	2016 TR Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24. Petition found insufficient. Sent petition back for additional information 4.2.24. Petition addendum sent to HS 5.22.24. Petition sufficiency due ~ 7.22.24. petitioned found sufficient 7.2.24. No new TR requested.	3.19.24 4.2.24 6.4.24 7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 6.4.24 7.16.24	TBD

Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.23.24	Fall 2024
---------------------	-------------	---	---------	-----------

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermentd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	7.16.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to HS 3.19.24. Sufficiency due ASAP. TR found sufficient 4.2.24.	6.18.24	" "
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	" "
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	" "

Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	7.23.24	" "
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	" "
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.23.24	" "
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.2.24	" "
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.2.24	" "
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	" "
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	" "

				TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24		
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	“ “
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.23.24	“ “
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates)	7.2.24	“ “

				2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	6.18.24	“ “
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24 7.16.24	“ “
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	“ “
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “

Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
--	------------	----	---	--	--------	-----

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	“ “

Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24	" "
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	" "
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	" "
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "

Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24	“ “
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, July 16, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Kim Huseman (KH); Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Wood Turner (WT)

Absent: Heather Kumar (HK)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jo Mirenda (JM)

Agenda

- Review notes: July 2, 2024
- 2026 sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Celery powder (WT)
 - Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL)
 - Ascorbic acid (NL)
 - L-Malic acid (NL)
 - Calcium citrate (CD)
 - Potassium citrate (CD)
 - Sodium citrate (CD)
- L-Malic acid reclassification (NL) - discuss/vote
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **July 2, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Celery powder (WT).** Celery powder is used to “cure” processed meat products without using prohibited nitrites. Celery powder is naturally high in nitrates that are converted to nitrites during fermentation by a lactic acid culture. The lead summarized the draft review, noted the issues around commercial availability, and highlighted the ongoing research on organic celery powder. A member added that commercial availability might not necessarily be one size fits all: e.g., producers might be seeking different features. Based on some outstanding questions about environmental impacts from conventional celery and ancillary substances, the Subcommittee vote was not unanimous.

Motion to remove celery powder from the National List at 205.606

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 2 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL).** The lead summarized the reviews for each of the acids separately, and recommended that they be renewed at this time. At the Spring 2024 meeting, the HS discussed whether to add an annotation for citric acid. Comments indicated that there are numerous suppliers of certified organic citric acid, however, there is not adequate organic supply to meet the demand. Based on that information, the HS feels that both acids should be relisted at this time, and they will revisit the idea of an annotation at the next sunset review. The group moved to a vote on the listing.

Motion to remove acids (citric and lactic) from the National List at 205.605(a)

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 0 No: 9 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Ascorbic acid (NL).** The lead summarized the many uses of ascorbic acid as well as public comments regarding alternatives. He noted there is some innovation with regard to alternatives, however, the alternatives can impart off flavors, so are not feasible in many types of products. The HS and stakeholders expressed support for relisting ascorbic acid.

Motion to remove ascorbic acid (NL) from the National List at 205.605(b)

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 9 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **2026 sunset: L-Malic acid (NL). L-Malic acid is listed as a non-synthetic at §205.605(a).** The group discussed the sunset listing and the proposal to reclassify L-Malic simultaneously. Previous Handling Subcommittees, supported by public commenters, have suggested relisting L-malic acid at §205.605(b) as a “synthetic” substance, to accurately reflect the predominant production method. The lead added that there are two ways to manufacture L-Malic. The most common form is synthetic, involving fumaric acid. The group discussed the production methods using fermentation processes, and clarified that the current listing, and what they are evaluating, is the sunset listing, which is the non-synthetic listing. The annotation change would address the synthetic version. The group voted on both the sunset and the proposal for a classification change. The lead will re-circulate the proposal to member before it is submitted to the NOP for the Fall 2024 meeting.

Motion to remove L-Malic acid from the National List § 205.605(a)

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 0 No: 9 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **L-Malic acid reclassification (NL) - discuss/vote**

Classification motion.

Motion to reclassify L-Malic acid produced by formation of synthetic fumaric acid as synthetic

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: KH

Yes: 9 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

Motion to add L-Malic acid produced by formation of synthetic fumaric acid at §205.605(b)

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 9 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Calcium citrate (CD).** Deferred to next call.
- **Potassium citrate (CD).** Deferred to next call.
- **Sodium citrate (CD).** Deferred to next call.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

July 2, 2024

Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - petition sufficiency/TR determination

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Potassium iodide (LP)

Potassium phosphate (LP)

Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP)

Pullulan (DN)

Fish oil (DN)

Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN)

Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida) (DN)

July 16, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Celery powder (WT)

Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL)

Ascorbic acid (NL)

L-Malic acid (NL)

L-Malic acid reclassification (NL) - discuss/vote

July 23, 2024 - Additional call 12:00 ET/9:00 PT

Calcium citrate (CD)

Potassium citrate (CD)

Sodium citrate (CD)

Magnesium sulfate (AJ)

Ferrous sulfate (AJ)

Nutrient vitamins and minerals (AJ)

Perlite (KH)

Activated charcoal (KH)

Collagen gel (KH)

Gelatin (KH)

Research Priorities (All) - discuss/send to Materials

August 6, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Fish oil (DN)

Enzymes (JD)

Microorganisms (JD)

Yeast (JD)

Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - discuss/vote

Ethylene - petitioned annotation change (NL) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Ethylene	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR.	8.6.24	Fall 2024
Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation Petition addendum	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	2016 TR Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24. Petition found insufficient. Sent petition back for additional information 4.2.24. Petition addendum sent to HS 5.22.24. Petition sufficiency due ~ 7.22.24. petitioned found sufficient 7.2.24. No new TR requested.	3.19.24 4.2.24 6.4.24 7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024

Other Projects

L-Malic acid reclassification	NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR		TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.23.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	7.16.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024

Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to HS 3.19.24. Sufficiency due ASAP. TR found sufficient 4.2.24.	6.18.24	“ “
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	“ “
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	7.23.24	“ “
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	“ “
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.23.24	“ “
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “

				TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24		
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.2.24	“ “
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	“ “
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	7.23.24	“ “
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	“ “
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.23.24	“ “

Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	“ “
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.23.24	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	6.18.24	“ “

Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24 7.16.24	“ ”
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ ”
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.23.24	“ ”
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ ”
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ ”
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ ”

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0

Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post
---------------------------	--------------	--------------

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	" "

Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24	“ ”
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ ”
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24	“ ”
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”

Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, July 2, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Dilip Nandwani (DN); Kim Huseman (KH)

Absent: Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Wood Turner (WT)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Jo Mirenda (JM)

Agenda

- Review notes: June 18, 2024
- Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - petition sufficiency/TR determination
- 2026 sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Potassium iodide (LP)
 - Potassium phosphate (LP)
 - Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP)
 - Pullulan (DN)
 - Fish oil (DN)
 - Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN)
 - Wakame seaweed (*Undaria pinnatifida*) (DN)
 - Magnesium sulfate (AJ)
 - Ferrous sulfate (AJ)
 - Nutrient vitamins and minerals (AJ)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **June 18, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - petition sufficiency/TR determination.** The NOP Food Technologist collaborate with the lead author to compile background research for potassium phosphate. The lead summarized the review history and previous public comment for phosphates in general. The background research includes information from the 2016 TR, peer-reviewed literature to assess health risks associated with phosphorus, and a compilation of alternatives that are already on the National List. The list of organic alternatives already on the National List will be included in the proposal. The group also discussed the FDA designation of GRAD (Generally Recognized as Safe) in relation to the petitioned use of potassium phosphate. The Handling Subcommittee will proceed with a proposal for the Fall 2024 meeting without requesting a new TR.
- **Potassium iodide (LP).** The lead provided a brief summary of potassium iodide. At the Spring meeting, the NOSB received written comments in support of relisting, and one comment that this substance should be listed at 205.605(b) as a synthetic.

Motion to remove potassium iodide from the national list at 205.605(a)

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: DN

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Potassium phosphate (LP).** The lead summarized the review, including uses and manufacture, and highlighted that potassium phosphate is approved for use in "made with" organic only. She also noted the petition for potassium phosphate that is under review concurrently, and will include any pertinent

information in her verbal summary at the Fall meeting. Members questioned the need for this material given that there are many alternatives, which is reflected in the vote below. The HS is anticipating public comment and discussion at the Board meeting.

Motion to remove potassium phosphate from the National List

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 3 No: 4 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP).** Sodium acid pyrophosphate has multiple uses in conventional agriculture, but is limited to use as a chemical leavener in organic. At the Spring meeting, commenters were supportive of relisting.

Motion to remove sodium acid pyrophosphate from the National List

Motion by: LP

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Pullulan (DN).** Pullulan is a non-agricultural, non-synthetic allowed. It is used to coat tablets and as an alternative to gelatin in capsules for dietary supplements. There was a 2018 TR and pullulan was added to the list in 2021. There appear to be no human health or environmental concerns. The lead also noted that there is a manufacturer producing organic pullulan, however, it is not currently being produced in sufficient quantities.

Motion to remove pullulan from the National List

Motion by: DN

Seconded by: AJ

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Fish oil (DN).** The lead gave a brief summary of the substance and noted it's use and manufacture. The group also discussed a [Fall 2021 NOSB recommendation](#) for an annotation, which NOP did not implement, based on concerns that it included a reference to a third-party standard. The group suggested capturing the history of the previous work in the current review. The lead will revise the document and bring it back to a future call for a vote.
- **Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN).** The lead summarized the two seaweeds (pacific kombu and wakame) noting that they are similar. Seaweed is used as food, in cosmetics and fertilizers, processed to extract thickening agents, and as an additive to animal feed. Public commenters asked that the two seaweeds be reviewed in the context of marine materials, and that the NOSB consider harvest restrictions. These comments emanate from a previous NOSB recommendation for Marine Macroalgae in Crop Fertility Inputs, which was not implemented by NOP.

Motion to remove seaweed, Pacific kombu

Motion by: DN

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida) (DN).** The lead summarized the two seaweeds (pacific kombu and wakame) noting that they are similar. Wakame is a brown seaweed used as food. Public commenters asked that the two seaweeds be reviewed in the context of marine materials, and that the NOSB consider harvest restrictions. These comments emanate from a previous NOSB recommendation for Marine Macroalgae in Crop Fertility Inputs, which was not implemented by NOP.

Motion to remove wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)

Motion by: DN

Seconded by: KH

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Magnesium sulfate (AJ).** Deferred to next call.
- **Ferrous sulfate (AJ).** Deferred to next call.
- **Nutrient vitamins and minerals (AJ).** Deferred to next call.
- **Additional Items.** The HS may add an extra call, either on July 23 or 30. The Chair will poll members.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

June 18, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Hydrogen peroxide (WT)

Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (WT)

Celery powder (WT)

Calcium chloride (KS)

Tocopherols (KS)

Orange pulp, dried (KS)

July 2, 2024

Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - petition sufficiency/TR determination

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Potassium iodide (LP)

Potassium phosphate (LP)

Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP)

Pullulan (DN)

Fish oil (DN)

Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN)

Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida) (DN)

July 16, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Fish oil (DN)

Magnesium sulfate (AJ)

Ferrous sulfate (AJ)

Nutrient vitamins and minerals (AJ)

Calcium citrate (CD)

Potassium citrate (CD)

Sodium citrate (CD)

Celery powder (WT)

Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL)

Ascorbic acid (NL)
 L-Malic acid (NL)
 Research Priorities (All) - discuss/send to Materials
 L-Malic acid reclassification (NL) - discuss/vote
 July 23, 2024
 July 30, 2024
 August 6, 2024
 2026 sunsets - discuss/vote
 Enzymes (JD)
 Microorganisms (JD)
 Yeast (JD)
 Perlite (KH)
 Activated charcoal (KH)
 Collagen gel (KH)
 Gelatin (KH)
 Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - discuss/vote
 Ethylene - petitioned annotation change (NL) - discuss/vote
 August 20, 2024
 September 3, 2024
 September 17, 2024
 October 1, 2024
 October 15, 2024
 November 5, 2024
 November 19, 2024
 December 3, 2024
 December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Ethylene	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR.	8.6.24	Fall 2024
Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	2016 TR Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24. Petition found insufficient. Sent petition back for additional information 4.2.24. Petition addendum sent to HS 5.22.24. Petition sufficiency due ~ 7.22.24. petitioned found sufficient 7.2.24. No new TR requested.	3.19.24 4.2.24 6.4.24 7.2.24 8.6.24	Fall 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 6.4.24 7.16.24	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.16.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	7.16.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to HS 3.19.24. Sufficiency due ASAP. TR found sufficient 4.2.24.	6.18.24	" "
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	" "

L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	7.16.24	“ “
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	“ “
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	8.6.24	“ “
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.2.24	“ “
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.2.24	“ “
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	“ “

Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	“ “
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.16.24	“ “
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	8.6.24	“ “
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “

Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.16.24	" "
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	" "
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	" "
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.16.24	" "
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	6.18.24	" "
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24 7.16.24	" "
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	" "
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	" "

Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699		“ “

Milestones

NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025

Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24	" "
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	" "
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "

Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ ”
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24	“ ”
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”

Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, June 18, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Wood Turner (WT); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Absent: Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Kim Huseman (KH)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Jo Mirenda (JM)

Agenda

- Review notes: June 4, 2024
- Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - petition sufficiency.
- L-Malic acid reclassification (NL) - discuss
- 2026 sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL)
 - Calcium chloride (KS)
 - L-Malic acid (NL)
 - Ascorbic acid (NL)
 - Hydrogen peroxide (WT)
 - Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (WT)
 - Tocopherols (KS)
 - Orange pulp, dried (KS)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **June 4, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2026 sunsets - discuss/vote**
 - **Hydrogen peroxide (WT).** The lead indicated that this substance is straight forward. Hydrogen peroxide is a weak acid, and used as an antimicrobial disinfectant and sanitizer. It is also listed in Crops and Livestock. The lead noted human health and environmental issues, and the HS will include the questions from the Spring meeting, since there wasn't much feedback.

Motion to remove hydrogen peroxide from the National List

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (WT).** Peracetic acid is used as a sanitizer, as an alternative to chlorine materials. There are no environmental impacts. There are ancillary substances called out in the review, and the HS added a question to stakeholders about ancillaries. The lead noted there is strong support by the community and previous Boards for relisting.

Motion to remove peracetic acid/peroxyacetic acid from the National List

Motion by: WT

Seconded by: DN

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Celery powder (WT).** The lead summarized the review for celery powder, noting the main concerns are that it is non-organic and there are health concerns regarding nitrates. The NOSB hosted a panel on celery powder at the 2019 meeting, and there is ongoing research on alternatives. During the last comment period there was general support for relisting, and concerns were voiced from both the non-profit and public sectors. At the last sunset review, the NOSB relisted celery powder with a split vote. The HS will continue the discussion and deferred the vote to the next call.
- **Calcium chloride (KS).** The lead summarized the uses and manufacture of calcium chloride noting it is widely used. The HS received confirmation that certifiers are verifying which manufacturing process is used to determine if it's synthetic or not. Spring commenters were mostly in favor of relisting.

Motion to remove calcium chloride from the National List

Motion by: KS

Seconded by: AJ

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Tocopherols (KS).** The lead discussed the annotation and noted that the TR was not available for the Spring meeting, so she added new information for the Fall version of the review. There are ancillary substances. The HS was supportive of relisting tocopherols and moved to a vote.

Motion to remove tocopherols from the National List

Motion by: KS

Seconded by: DN

Yes: 0 No: 7 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Orange pulp, dried (KS).** Orange pulp, dried is listed at 205.606 so there is a commercial availability clause. If it is removed from 205.606, then operations would be required to use organic only. It was noted that proximity of processing facilities to the groves is an issue for supply. During the last review, the NOSB received about 8 comments in response to questions, and certifiers reported that it is not widely used. Additionally, a manufacturer is making an organic version but it is not clear if supply is sufficient and adequate. The Board vote at the last sunset review was split. The HS is proposing removal based on lack of essentiality.

Motion to remove orange pulp, dried from the National List at 205.606

Motion by: KS

Seconded by: AJ

Yes: 5 No: 2 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 2

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

June 4, 2024

L-Malic acid reclassification (NL) - discuss

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

L-Malic acid (NL)

June 18, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Hydrogen peroxide (WT)

Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (WT)

Celery powder (WT)

Calcium chloride (KS)

Tocopherols (KS)

Orange pulp, dried (KS)

July 2, 2024

Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - petition sufficiency/TR determination

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Potassium iodide (LP)

Potassium phosphate (LP)

Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP)

Magnesium sulfate (AJ)

Ferrous sulfate (AJ)

Nutrient vitamins and minerals (AJ)

Pullulan (DN)

Fish oil (DN)

Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN)

Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida) (DN)

July 16, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Calcium citrate (CD)

Potassium citrate (CD)

Sodium citrate (CD)

Celery powder (WT)

Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL)

Ascorbic acid (NL)

Research Priorities (All) - discuss/send to Materials

L-Malic acid reclassification (NL) - discuss/vote

August 6, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Enzymes (JD)

Microorganisms (JD)

Yeast (JD)

Perlite (KH)

Activated charcoal (KH)

Collagen gel (KH)

Gelatin (KH)

Ethylene - petitioned annotation change (NL) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Ethylene	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR.	8.6.24	Fall 2024
Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	2016 TR Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24. Petition found insufficient. Sent petition back for additional information 4.2.24. Petition addendum sent to HS 5.22.24.	7.2.24	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 6.4.24 7.16.24	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.16.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	----------------	--------	----------------------	-------------------

Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	7.16.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to HS 3.19.24. Sufficiency due ASAP. TR found sufficient 4.2.24.	6.18.24	" "
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	" "
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	" "
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	7.2.24	" "
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due	8.6.24	" "

				2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24		
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	8.6.24	" "
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.2.24	" "
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.2.24	" "
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	" "
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	8.6.24	" "
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	" "
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	" "

				Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23		
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	8.6.24	“ “
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.16.24	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “

Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	7.16.24	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	6.18.24	“ “
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24 7.16.24	“ “
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	8.6.24	“ “
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "

Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24	" "
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	" "
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	" "
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24	" "
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "

Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
--------------------------------	------------	----	---	---	--------	-----

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, June 4, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Wood Turner (WT); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Absent: Kim Huseman (KH)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Jo Mirenda (JM)

Agenda

- Review notes: May 21, 2024
- Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - petition sufficiency.
- L-Malic acid reclassification (NL) - discuss
- 2026 sunsets - discuss/vote
 - Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL)
 - Calcium chloride (KS)
 - L-Malic acid (NL)
 - Ascorbic acid (NL)
 - Hydrogen peroxide (WT)
 - Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (WT)
 - Tocopherols (KS)
 - Orange pulp, dried (KS)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **May 21, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - petition sufficiency.** Members had a robust conversation about the petition to amend, and will do some background research before discussing petition sufficiency again on July 2.
- **L-Malic acid reclassification + 2026 sunset review (NL).** In previous sunset reviews, the NOSB identified L-malic acid as mis-classified. The lead noted that it was reviewed in 2003 and added to the list in 2006, and in the early days the classification process wasn't as refined as it is now, so it is worth taking another look. The group discussed both the proposed reclassification and the 2026 sunset review. The lead noted that there are three different ways to make L-malic acid: Two 2-step processes that are akin to fermentation, and one that has a one step process. Members discussed the options for listing and relisting this substance, which is manufactured both non-synthetically and synthetically. The HS will proceed with three separate votes, one for the sunset review, and two for annotation changes, on the July 16 call.
- **2026 sunsets - discuss/vote** - All deferred to next meeting due to time.
 - Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL)
 - Calcium chloride (KS)
 - Ascorbic acid (NL)
 - Hydrogen peroxide (WT)
 - Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (WT)
 - Tocopherols (KS)
 - Orange pulp, dried (KS)
- **Additional Items. None.**
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

May 21, 2024

2027 sunsets - TR determinations

Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin), Carnauba wax (LP).

Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (KH).

June 4, 2024

L-Malic acid reclassification (NL) - discuss

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

L-Malic acid (NL)

June 18, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL)

Ascorbic acid (NL)

Hydrogen peroxide (WT)

Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (WT)

Celery powder (WT)

Calcium chloride (KS)

Tocopherols (KS)

Orange pulp, dried (KS)

Calcium citrate (CD)

Potassium citrate (CD)

Sodium citrate (CD)

July 2, 2024

Potassium iodide (LP)

Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation (CD) - petition sufficiency

Potassium phosphate (LP)

Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP)

Magnesium sulfate (AJ)

Pullulan (DN)

Ferrous sulfate (AJ)

Fish oil (DN)

Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN)

Wakame seaweed (*Undaria pinnatifida*) (DN)

Nutrient vitamins and minerals (AJ)

July 16, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Enzymes (JD)

Microorganisms (JD)

Yeast (JD)

Perlite (KH)

Activated charcoal (KH)

Collagen gel (KH)

Gelatin (KH)

Research Priorities (All) - discuss/send to Materials

Potassium phosphate petition (CD) - Petition sufficiency/TR determination

L-Malic acid reclassification (NL) - discuss/vote

August 6, 2024

Ethylene – petitioned annotation change (NL) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2024
 September 3, 2024
 September 17, 2024
 October 1, 2024
 October 15, 2024
 November 5, 2024
 November 19, 2024
 December 3, 2024
 December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Ethylene	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR.	8.6.24	Fall 2024
Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	2016 TR Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24. Petition found insufficient. Sent petition back for additional information 4.2.24. Petition addendum sent to HS 5.22.24.	7.2.24	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	NL	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 6.4.24 7.16.24	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.16.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Con tact	TR Re quest?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	-------------	--------------------	--------	----------------------	-------------------

Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	6.18.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to HS 3.19.24. Sufficiency due ASAP. TR found sufficient 4.2.24.	6.18.24	" "
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	7.16.24	" "
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	" "
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	7.2.24	" "
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due	7.16.24	" "

				2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24		
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.16.24	" "
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	6.18.24	" "
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.2.24	" "
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	7.16.24	" "
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	7.16.24	" "
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	" "
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	" "

				Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23		
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.16.24	“ “
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	6.18.24	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “

Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	6.18.24	" "
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	6.18.24	" "
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	" "
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	" "
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	" "
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	" "
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	" "
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	" "

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "

Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24	" "
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	" "
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	" "
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24	" "
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "

Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”

Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
--------------------------------	------------	----	---	---	--------	-----

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, May 21, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH);

Absent: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review notes: April 16, 2024
- 2027 Sunsets TR determinations
 - Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin) (LP)
 - Carnauba Wax (LP)
 - Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (KH)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **April 16, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **2027 Sunsets TR determinations**
 - **Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin), Carnauba Wax (LP).** There was a 2014 TR for the waxes. While it has been 10 years, this would be a low-medium priority for a new TR. The last Board recommended renewal, but also suggested an annotation. Members contributed some background about the use of waxes, and chose to not request a new TR at this time.
 - **Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (KH).** The group discussed the need for a new TR. Given the age of the last TR (2016) and the fact that they did not request a TR for two other phosphates currently under review, the HS will not request a new TR at this time. Instead, they will add a note to the review recommending a new TR at the next sunset review.
 - **Ozone.** The HS will request a full scope TR and may revisit that decision if they have to cut shorten the list.
 - **Kaolin (WT).** The HS confirmed the questions for the limited scope TR for kaolin, and the NOSB Chair will add it to the final list.
- **Additional Items.**
 - **Consent calendar proposal.** The PDS has been discussing efficiencies in process, and have resurrected the idea of a consent calendar. It was proposed as a discussion document in Fall 2020, and not approved by the Board. Members shared ideas and questions about how and when to implement this process change. Most members were supportive and wanted to continue talking about the details. Possible candidates for consent voting: Sunset substances that have a unanimous vote in Subcommittee and also had a unanimous NOSB vote for relisting at the previous sunset review.
 - **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

April 16, 2024

2027 sunsets - TR determinations

- Kaolin (WT)
- Sodium bicarbonate (DN)
- Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)

- Ammonium carbonate (DN)
- Sodium hydroxide (NL)
- Colors (AJ)

May 7, 2024 - cancelled

May 21, 2024

2027 sunsets - TR determinations

Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin), Carnauba wax (LP).

Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic) (KH).

June 4, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL)

Calcium chloride (KS)

L-Malic acid (NL)

Ascorbic acid (NL)

Hydrogen peroxide (WT)

Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid (WT)

Tocopherols (KS)

Orange pulp, dried (KS)

L-Malic acid reclassification (NL) - discuss

June 18, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Potassium iodide (LP)

Calcium citrate (CD)

Potassium citrate (CD)

Potassium phosphate (LP)

Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP)

Sodium citrate (CD)

Celery powder (WT)

July 2, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Magnesium sulfate (FQ)

Pullulan (DN)

Ferrous sulfate (BC)

Fish oil (DN)

Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN)

Wakame seaweed (*Undaria pinnatifida*) (DN)

Nutrient vitamins and minerals (DN)

July 16, 2024

2026 sunsets - discuss/vote

Enzymes (JD)

Microorganisms (JD)

Yeast (JD)

Perlite (KH)

Activated charcoal (KH)

Collagen gel (KH)

Gelatin (KH)

Research Priorities (All) – discuss/send to Materials

Potassium Phosphate petition (CD) - Petition sufficiency/TR determination

August 6, 2024

Ethylene - petition (NL) - discuss/vote

August 20, 2024
 September 3, 2024
 September 17, 2024
 October 1, 2024
 October 15, 2024
 November 5, 2024
 November 19, 2024
 December 3, 2024
 December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Ethylene	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR.	8.6.24	Fall 2024
Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	2016 TR Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24. Petition found insufficient. Sent petition back for additional information 4.2.24. Petition addendum sent to HS 5.22.24.		TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 6.4.24	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Fall 2024 list due to MS by July 19, 2024	7.16.24	Fall 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Con tact	TR Re quest?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	-------------	--------------------	--------	----------------------	-------------------

Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	6.4.24	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to HS 3.19.24. Sufficiency due ASAP. TR found sufficient 4.2.24.	6.4.24	" "
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	7.16.24	" "
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	" "
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	7.2.24	" "
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due	7.16.24	" "

				2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24		
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	7.16.24	" "
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	6.18.24	" "
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.2.24	" "
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	7.16.24	" "
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	7.16.24	" "
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	" "
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	" "

				Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23		
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	7.16.24	“ “
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	6.18.24	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	“ “

Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	6.18.24	" "
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	6.4.24	" "
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.18.24	" "
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	" "
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.16.24	" "
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	6.4.24	" "
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	" "
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	7.2.24	" "

Milestones

Fall 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~May 24, 2024	21
NOP - Draft Fall 2024 NOSB meeting agenda	Aug 2, 2024	~10
NOSB - Fall 2024 proposals due to NOP	Aug 14, 2024	~9
NOP - Post proposals	Aug 30, 2024	~7.5
Public comment closes	Sep 30, 2024	~4.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	~Oct 3, 2024	~2
Public comment webinars	Oct 15 & 17, 2024	1
Fall 2024 NOSB meeting - Portland, OR	Oct 22 - 24, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	Nov 25, 2024	30 days post

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (May 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24 5.21.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "

Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24	" "
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	" "
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	" "
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24	" "
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "

Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ ”
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”

Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
--------------------------------	------------	----	---	---	--------	-----

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, April 16, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Dilip Nandwani (DN);

Absent: Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Esu Obu (EO)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK)

Agenda

- Review notes: April 2, 2024
- Discuss upcoming meeting and public comments
- 2027 Sunsets TR determinations
 - Kaolin (WT)
 - Sodium bicarbonate (DN)
 - Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)
 - Ammonium carbonate (DN)
 - Sodium hydroxide (NL)
 - Colors (AJ)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **April 2, 2024 notes** were approved with no changes
- **Discuss upcoming meeting and public comments.** The HS members discussed the process for introducing topics at the Spring meeting, specifically how to present sunsets that might be candidates for annotation changes.
- **2027 Sunsets TR determinations**
 - **Kaolin (WT).** The lead noted that the last technical report was a TAP from 1995. There are no real concerns except that kaolin is mined. i.e., use is not the issue, production is. The HS will request a limited scope TR. The lead will submit specific questions.
 - **Sodium bicarbonate, ammonium bicarbonate, ammonium carbonate (DN).** All three substances have old TAPs (1995). The lead suggested a new TR based on the fact that there isn't any, or much, information about the manufacturing process. A previous Board added a note about a possible annotation for sodium bicarbonate. Members provided feedback about the need to request a TR, and leaned towards a limited scope TR. The members discussed specific information they would seek, and may loop back to this one to discuss specific questions.
 - **Sodium hydroxide (NL).** The last TR was from 2020, and the HS will not request a new TR at this time.
 - **Colors (AJ).** The Last TR was from 2015, and seems comprehensive and thorough. The HS will not request a new TR at this time.
- **Additional Items.**
 - The Chair asked if members had an interest in gathering background research for mined materials in general. Would like to ask if the Food Techs (FTs) could do research about which mined materials are on the list. The Food tech asked that the HS provide specific info in the request, to narrow the scope.
 - A member shared a request for the FTs to work on background research for plastic use in organic.
 - Another member cautioned the group to consider the scope of these projects and the possible impacts to the organic industry.

- The HS Chair will draft the requests for TRs
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

Previous HS Notes

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

April 2, 2024

Calcium Chloride (KS) - TR sufficiency

Potassium phosphate (CD) - Amend to remove annotation. Petition sufficiency.

April 16, 2024

2027 sunsets - TR determinations

- Kaolin (WT)
- Sodium bicarbonate (DN)
- Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)
- Ammonium carbonate (DN)
- Sodium hydroxide (NL)
- Colors (AJ)

May 7, 2024 - cancelled

May 21, 2024

2027 sunsets - TR determinations

- Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)
- Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)
- Carnauba Wax

June 4, 2024

June 18, 2024

July 2, 2024

July 16, 2024

August 6, 2024

August 20, 2024

September 3, 2024

September 17, 2024

October 1, 2024

October 15, 2024

November 5, 2024

November 19, 2024

December 3, 2024

December 17, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	----------	--------	------------------	----------------

Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23 TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Ethylene	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR.	3.19.24 4.2.24	TBD
Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	2016 TR Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24. Petition found insufficient. Will send back to petition for additional information 4.2.24	3.19.24 4.2.24	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	Spr 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermentd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23 12.19.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to HS 3.19.24. Sufficiency due ASAP. TR found sufficient 4.2.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24 4.2.24	" "
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	" "
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "

Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24 3.19.24	" "
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24 3.19.24	" "
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	" "
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	" "
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	" "

Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	" "
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	" "
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	" "
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	" "
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	" "
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	" "
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	" "
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	" "

Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24 2.20.24	“ “
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN	Y - Lmt'd Scope (w/Ammonium bicarbonate, and Ammonium carbonate)	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	" "

Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24	“ “
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24	“ “

Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, April 2, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Kyla Smith (KS); Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP); Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Esu Obu (EO)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK);

Agenda

- Review notes: March 19, 2024
- 2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - TR sufficiency
- Petition sufficiency: Potassium phosphate (CD)
- Petition sufficiency: Ethylene (NL) - TR needed?
- 2027 Sunsets TR determinations
 - Kaolin (WT)
 - Sodium bicarbonate (DN)
 - Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)
 - Ammonium carbonate (DN)
 - Low-acyl gellan gum (KS)
 - Orange shellac (KS)
 - Ozone (JD)
 - Cornstarch (native) (CD)
 - Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CD)
 - Glycerin (CD)
- Standing item: Work items for food techs
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **March 19, 2024 notes** were approved with no changes
- **2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - TR sufficiency.** The HS reviewed the new information provided by technical report contractor. The lead noted that the additions clarified some questions but still did not completely answer the questions about the Solvay manufacturing process. Despite that, the HS finds the TR sufficient, and it provides the information they need to proceed with the review. The lead also expressed appreciation to the TR writer for adding headings, which was helpful and clear.
- **Petition sufficiency: Potassium phosphate (CD).** The lead noted that potassium phosphate is currently restricted to 'made with' organic, and the petitioner is asking that the restriction be removed so it can be used in organic products. The HS has some additional questions for the petitioner regarding the justification for removal and therefore deem the petition insufficient at this time. The lead will send questions to the NOP to forward to the petitioner.
- **Petition sufficiency: Ethylene (KS for NL) - TR needed?** The lead proposed two paths given that ethylene is already on the National List, and the petitioner is seeking to expand its use to onions and potatoes. The first option would be to request a limited scope TR, and the second to ask the Food Technologists to conduct a literature review. The HS discussed the two options and decided to request a limited scope TR. The NOSB Chair will respond to the email and relay the conversation to the NOP to focus questions on human and environmental health.
- **2027 Sunsets TR determinations.**

- The Food Technologists have been evaluating the sunset lists for possible annotation updates/changes and will provide the list soon. In the interim, the HS proceeded with determinations for updated TRs.
- **Kaolin (WT)** - deferred to next call
- **Sodium bicarbonate (DN)** - deferred to next call
- **Ammonium bicarbonate (DN)** - deferred to next call
- **Ammonium carbonate (DN)** - deferred to next call
- **Low-acyl gellan gum (KS)**. Low-acyl gellan gum was recently added to the National List and is undergoing its first sunset review. The lead would like to sync its review with the rest of the gums for the next sunset review, which means it would get reviewed a year early. There was a 2018 TR for gums, and the HS will not seek a new one at this time.
- **Orange shellac (KS)**. The lead noted that orange shellac is listed at 205.606, and is used in food coatings and confectionaries. The last TR was from 2014, and given that there hasn't been a change in manufacturing, was found to be adequate. The HS will not request a new one.
- **Ozone (JD)**. Supported by a 1995 TAP and added to the list in 2001. The last sunset review (in 2020) indicates that the positive uses outweigh any negative aspects. The lead recommended a new TR, and the HS will send a message to the NOP.
- **Cornstarch (native) (CD)**. The lead noted that there has never been a TAP or TR so recommended that the HS request one.
- **Inulin-oligofructose enriched (CD)**. The last TR was from 2015. The HS will not request a new TR.
- **Glycerin (CD)**. The HS will not request a new TR.
- **Additional Items**. The group discussed the Spring meeting process e.g., how much time to devote to each sunset, what to include in the discussion, and a summary of public comments.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

March 19, 2024

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - TR sufficiency
 2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - TR sufficiency
 Potassium phosphate - Amend to remove annotation
 2027 Sunsets - Review initial list and assign leads

April 2, 2024

Calcium Chloride (KS) - TR sufficiency
 Potassium phosphate (CD) - Amend to remove annotation. Petition sufficiency.

April 16, 2024

2027 sunsets - TR determinations
 Kaolin (WT) - deferred to next call
 Sodium bicarbonate (DN) - deferred to next call
 Ammonium bicarbonate (DN) - deferred to next call
 Ammonium carbonate (DN) - deferred to next call
 Sodium hydroxide (NL)
 Colors (AJ)

May 7, 2024

May 21, 2024

June 4, 2024

June 18, 2024

July 2, 2024

July 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Ethylene	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. HS requested a limited scope TR.	3.19.24 4.2.24	TBD
Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	2016 TR Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24. Petition found insufficient. Will send back to petition for additional information 4.2.24	3.19.24 4.2.24	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
---------	---------	--------	----------------------	----------------

L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	 2.6.24	Spr 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermentd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23 12.19.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to HS 3.19.24. Sufficiency due ASAP. TR found sufficient 4.2.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24 4.2.24	" "
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	" "

Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24 3.19.24	" "
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24 3.19.24	" "
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	" "
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	" "

				TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24		
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates)	3.21.23 5.16.23	“ “

				2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	2.6.24	
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	" "
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	" "
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24 2.20.24	" "
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	" "
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	" "
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	" "
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	" "
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	" "

Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
--	------------	----	---	--	--------------------------------	-----

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “

Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	" "
Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	" "
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS	N	Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24	" "
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	" "
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	" "
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	" "

Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24	“ “
Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD	Y	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS	N	Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ ”

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, March 19, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Absent: Logan Petrey (LP)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review notes: February 20, 2024
- Potassium Iodide - TR sufficiency
- 2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - TR sufficiency
- Ethylene - petition sufficiency (NL)
- Potassium phosphate - Assign lead, Need sufficiency determination by May 10
- 2027 Sunsets - Review initial list and leads
- Work items for Food Technologists
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 20, 2024 notes** were accepted as written.
- **Potassium Iodide (AJ for LP) - TR sufficiency.** The lead summarized the TR and indicated that it was found sufficient. She highlighted the inclusion of information regarding environmental concerns and manufacturing. The HS Chair will let the NOP know, so the NOP can get the TR posted as soon as possible.
- **2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - TR sufficiency.** The lead summarized the uses of perlite, which is a filtering aid. The draft review was already posted for the Spring meeting, before receipt of the TR, so some of the information from the new TR will be added prior to the Fall meeting review. The lead noted that the TR included detail about different types of filtering aids, was objective, written in plain language, thorough, and provided detailed information. The Handling Subcommittee deemed the TR sufficient.
- **Ethylene - petition sufficiency (NL).** Ethylene was reviewed recently for its sunset review. The NOSB received a petition to expand its use to include sprout inhibition in potatoes and onions in storage. A member questioned the dichotomy that ethylene is used to ripen bananas, yet it inhibits sprouting in potatoes and onions. The group discussed the use, essentiality, and efficacy. A member mentioned the timing of the use, which may be for shipping purposes. The petition was found sufficient, and the HS doesn't feel the need to request a full TR, but will discuss the possible need for a limited scope TR on a future call.
- **Potassium phosphate - petition to amend annotation.** CD volunteered to lead the review and will determine petition sufficiency on the April 2 call.
- **2027 Sunsets - Review initial list and assign leads.** The NOSB Officers and Subcommittee Chairs updated the work schedules for each of the Subcommittees, noting that there will be 5 members rotating off, and 5 new members starting in the middle of the review cycle. HS has 24 sunsets, 10 of which are colors, and they are targeting the end of May to determine TR needs. The group scheduled discussion dates for TR determinations. Draft proposals will be due to the HS Chair 5/16/24.
- **Work items for Food Technologists.** Working on annotations and setting up the 2027 sunset templates, and will flag the substances that have possible annotation changes.
- **Additional Items.**

- The group discussed TR rankings, questions for limited scope TRs, and what other projects may be ready for the Fall meeting. The NOP will send the HS links to where they can find the evaluation questions for the TRs.
- Inerts. The Food Techs are working on functional groups, and the Handling Subcommittee is seeking to begin work on the proposal in June.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

February 20, 2024

Tocopherols (KS) - TR sufficiency

March 5, 2024 - cancelled

March 19, 2024

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - TR sufficiency

2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - TR sufficiency

Potassium phosphate - Amend to remove annotation

2027 Sunsets - Review initial list and assign leads

April 2, 2024

Calcium Chloride (KS) - TR sufficiency

Potassium phosphate (CD) - Amend to remove annotation. Petition sufficiency.

April 16, 2024

May 7, 2024

May 21, 2024

June 4, 2024

June 18, 2024

July 2, 2024

July 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024

Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23 TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Ethylene	205.605	NL	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.21.24. Petition suff. due 04.21.24. Petition found sufficient 3.19.24. May request limited scope TR.	3.19.24 4.2.24?	TBD
Potassium phosphate - amend to remove annotation	205.605(b)	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 3.11.24. Petition suff. due 05.10.24	3.19.24 4.2.24	TBD

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	Spr 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Re quest?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	---------	--------------	--------	-------------------	----------------

Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 Lmt'd Scope TR TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23 12.19.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer. Updated TR sent to HS 3.19.24. ASAP	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24 4.2.24	" "
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	" "
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "

				2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24		
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24 3.19.24	“ “
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024. TR sent to HS 3.12.24, Sufficiency due 5.11.24. TR found sufficient 3.19.24	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24 3.19.24	“ “
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	“ “
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 2024 TR TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “

Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	" "
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	" "
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	" "
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	" "
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	" "
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: Lmt'd Scope 2024 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	" "
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	" "
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	" "

Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	" "
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24 2.20.24	" "
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	" "
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	" "
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	" "
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	" "
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	" "
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	" "

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

2027 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2024), Summary (Spr 2025), Review (Fall 2025)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request ?	Notes*	Schedule d/status	Target meeting
Kaolin	205.605(a)(15)	WT		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Kaolin, Bentonite) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	Summary: Spr 2025 Review: Fall 2025
Sodium bicarbonate	205.605(a)(26)	DN		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Baking powder, aluminum-free) TAP: 1995 (Sodium carbonates) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	" "
Waxes-nonsynthetic (wood resin)	205.605(a)(29)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 (Wood rosin) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	5.21.24	" "

Ammonium bicarbonate	205.605(b)(4)	DN		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Ammonium carbonate	205.605(b)(5)	DN		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 (Ammonium bicarbonate, Ammonium carbonate) TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Calcium phosphates (monobasic, dibasic, and tribasic)	205.605(b)(9)	KH		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2016 (Phosphates: calcium, potassium, sodium) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Low-acyl gellan gum	205.605(b)(18)	KS		Sunset date: 12/14/2027 TR: 2018 (Gums) 2020/Fall - Rec to ADD 11/14/2022 87 FR 68021	4.2.24	“ “
Ozone	205.605(b)(21)	JD		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Sodium hydroxide	205.605(b)(32)	NL		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2020 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Carnauba wax	205.606(a)	LP		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1996 (Fruit waxes) TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	5.21.24	“ “
Beet juice extract color	205.606(d)(1)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Beta-carotene extract color	205.606(d)(2)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2011 (β-Carotene) TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 04/14/2023 88 FR 22893	4.16.24	“ “

Black/purple carrot juice color	205.606(d)(3)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Chokeberry, aronia juice color	205.606(d)(4)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Elderberry juice color	205.606(d)(5)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Grape skin extract color	205.606(d)(6)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Purple sweet potato juice color	205.606(d)(7)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Red cabbage extract color	205.606(d)(8)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Red radish extract color	205.606(d)(9)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Saffron extract color	205.606(d)(10)	AJ		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 (Colors) 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.16.24	“ “
Cornstarch (native)	205.606(e)	CD		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: NA 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Glycerin	205.606(i)	CD		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1995 TR: 2013 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Inulin-oligofructose enriched	205.606(k)	CD		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TR: 2015 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “
Orange shellac	205.606(n)	KS		Sunset date: 03/15/2027 TAP: 1999 (Waxes) TAP: 2002 TR: 2014 2020/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	4.2.24	“ “

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, February 20, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Absent: Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review notes: February 6, 2024
- Tocopherols (KS) -TR sufficiency (due 4.16.24)
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **February 6, 2024 notes** were accepted as written
- **Tocopherols (KS) - TR sufficiency.** The lead summarized the TR, and noted that tocopherols are manufactured in various ways, and can be synthetic or non-synthetic. The group discussed seeking information about the relative percentages of synthetic vs. non synthetic supply, and if the TR is the correct place to ask that. The TR was found sufficient. The HS will send an additional question about availability to the NOP to add to the Spring sunset review, which was already submitted.
- **Additional Items.**
 - **NOSB workflow.** The NOSB Officers and Subcommittee Chairs will meet to review work agendas, workflow, and schedules for the upcoming semester/year. The group discussed the idea of projects for the Food Technologists, and how they may be able to help with the workload, such as having them create the initial review templates for the sunsets, and perhaps do an initial review of the upcoming 2027 sunsets and flagging which ones could use an updated TR. A member mentioned that the goal was to refresh the TRs approximately every 10 years or so, and cautioned against delegating that determination to the NOP. Members asked about deadlines and due dates, and supported the goal of getting the sunsets on a better schedule. The NOSB Officers will talk about best practices.
 - **Fermentation panel:** A member introduced the idea of hosting a fermentation panel, which is a topic that intersects with several sunset reviews this term: yeast, enzymes, microorganisms, etc. He noted there are lingering questions, both specific and more general, and a panel might be helpful. The HS Chair suggested the idea of inviting speakers to future Handling Subcommittee calls before the Fall meeting, to help focus their thoughts and questions, and to inform their votes at the Fall meeting. The member noted that the cornerstone is “continuous improvement”, and this could help move the topic in a forward trajectory. Members will think about potential speakers and talk about this at a future call.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals are due

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review
 2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review
 Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024

Tocopherols (KS) - TR sufficiency

March 5, 2024 - cancelled

March 19, 2024

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS). TR sufficiency, if available.

2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - TR sufficiency

2027 Sunsets; Review initial list and assign leads

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23 TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
---------	---------	--------	----------------------	----------------

L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	 2.6.24	Spr 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combined with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermentd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23 12.19.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested clarification from the TR writer.	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24 3.19.24	" "
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	" "
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "

				TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.		
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24 3.19.24	" "
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	" "
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	" "
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	" "
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	" "

Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	" "
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	" "
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	" "
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	" "
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	" "
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	" "
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	" "
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	" "

Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	" "
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024. TR sent to HS 2.16.24. TR suff due 4.16.24. TR found sufficient 2.20.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24 2.20.24	" "
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	" "
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	" "
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	" "
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	" "
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	" "
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	" "

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, February 6, 2024 12:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH)

Absent: Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review notes: January 23, 2024
- Review steps to finalize spring meeting documents
- 2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review/TR sufficiency
- 2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review/TR sufficiency
- 2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review
- Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss/finalize
- 2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 23, 2024 notes** were approved as written.
- **Review steps to finalize spring meeting documents.** February 15 is the due date. Please send final documents to Allison and NOP.
- **2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS).** The lead summarized the substance and TR, noting that the last TR was from 1995. The new TR contained comprehensive information about the material, however, the HS wanted to clarify two items before deeming the TR sufficient: the trona process (manufacturing) and whether it is synthetic or nonsynthetic; and commercial availability. Members posed several questions, and the lead modified the review based on feedback. The lead will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH).** The lead summarized the substance. This is the first sunset review since it was added to the National List. Members asked a couple of questions, and the lead will complete the document and submit it to the NOP for the Spring 2024 meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ).** The lead summarized the TR and indicated that it was sufficient. She incorporated the pertinent information into the review document for the Spring meeting and will send an email to the NOP indicating the determination. The lead also summarized the substance review (uses, manufacture, etc.) and the HS accepted the review for the Spring 2024 meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP).** The lead summarized the substance uses and manufacture. Potassium phosphate is used in "made-with" products. There were no additional questions from members. The lead will forward the final document to the NOP for the Spring meeting.
- **Research Priorities (LP, All).** The HS liaison reviewed the HS research priorities, and the group approved the top three priorities, and deemed the remainder of the list important, but not pressing. The HS will forward the completed list to the Materials Subcommittee for review.
- **2026 Sunset: Microorganisms, Enzymes, Yeast (JD).** The lead summarized all three substances (Microorganisms, Enzymes, and Yeast) for use, manufacture, and health aspects. The group discussed the questions to stakeholders, focused on excluded methods and ancillary substances, and looks

forward to hearing public comments. The lead will submit three separate reviews/documents for the Spring meeting.

- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

January 23, 2024

Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote

2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals are due

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review

Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS). TR sufficiency, if available.

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024

Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23 TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	Spr 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23 12.19.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24. The HS requested	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24 2.20.24	" "

				clarification from the TR writer.		
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	" "
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. TR sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24. TR found sufficient 2.6.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	" "
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	" "
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	" "
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "

				TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24		
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	" "
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	" "
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	" "
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) Added to NL April 2019 NOSB Recommendation 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	" "
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	" "
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	" "
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	" "

Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	" "
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	" "
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	" "
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	" "
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	" "
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	" "
Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	" "
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	" "
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	" "

Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, January 23, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP)

Absent: Dilip Nandwani (DN)

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review notes: January 16, 2024
- Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP) - discuss review
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **January 16, 2024 notes** were approved with no changes.
- **Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS).** The lead summarized modifications made to the draft review since the last discussion and members provided feedback. The group agreed that neither substance is essential for organic chicory powder production, given that it is synthetic and there are currently many alternative organic agricultural substances as well as other anti-caking agents that are already listed on the National List. The HS moved to a vote.

Motion to classify magnesium carbonate and magnesium carbonate hydroxide as non-agricultural, synthetic.

Motion by: NL

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 8 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

Motion to add magnesium carbonate and magnesium carbonate hydroxide to the NL for use as an anti-caking agent in chicory powder

Motion by: KS

Seconded by: NL

Yes: 0 No: 8 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 1

- **2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH).** The lead introduced the review for perlite and noted there is a pending TR. Perlite has been on the National List since 1996, and the last technical review was done then as well. The lead summarized use, manufacture, and health and environmental concerns. The HS added a question to the review, and will add any new info from the TR once it is available. The HS will submit the final review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS).** The lead summarized tocopherols, and noted that the HS is awaiting a Limited Scope TR, which is not expected back before the proposal due date. The TR will be available before the Fall meeting. The main focus of the discussion was the classification and annotation. The group discussed a potential annotation change, and will talk more about it at the Spring meeting, since they should have the TR back by then. A member suggested the possibility of posting the updated review (after the information from the TR is included) to the open docket between meetings. The group added questions for stakeholders and the HS will submit the final review for the Spring NOSB meeting.

- **2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP).** The lead indicated that there is a pending TR due back in March. She summarized the draft review including use, manufacture, and human health and environmental issues. There were no additional edits, and the HS will submit the review for the Spring meeting
- **2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP).** The lead summarized the draft review including use, manufacture, and human health and environmental issues. The group discussed the impacts of phosphorous on the human diet, with particular focus on health effects of phosphorous provided by phosphate additives versus natural phosphorous in foods. The HS will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP).** Deferred to later call.
- **Additional Items.**
 - The Research Priorities co-lead (LP) will send the Handling priorities to the group for discussion on the next call.
 - The HS added an extra hour to the call on February 6.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Activated charcoal (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Gelatin (KH) - discuss review

Rye Pollen Extracts - petitioned (CD) - discuss/vote

Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote

2026 Sunset: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD) - TR sufficiency

Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss

January 23, 2024

Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote

2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals are due

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review

Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss/finalize

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024

April 2, 2024

April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/ status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	Spr 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Con tact	TR Re quest?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
-----------	---------------	-------------	--------------------	--------	----------------------	----------------

Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermntd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23 12.19.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb. TR sent to HS 1.22.24. Sufficiency due 3.22.24.	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	" "
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.23 2.6.24	" "
Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	" "

Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “

Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 2.6.24	“ “
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “

Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting

Note: Subcommittee notes may include preliminary discussions regarding substances considered for addition to or removal from the National List. They do not represent official National Organic Program (NOP) policy/regulations or NOSB recommendations. Proposals must be voted on by the full Board, to become recommendations to the USDA. Please see the NOP website for official NOP policy, regulations, and status of substances used in organic production and handling.

Handling Subcommittee (HS) Notes

Tuesday, January 16, 2024 1:00 pm ET

Present: Allison Johnson (AJ), Chair; Nate Lewis (NL), Vice Chair; Jerry D'Amore (JD); Wood Turner (WT); Kim Huseman (KH); Carolyn Dimitri (CD); Kyla Smith (KS); Logan Petrey (LP); Dilip Nandwani (DN);

Absent: None

Staff: Michelle Arsenault (MA); Jared Clark (JC); Heather Kumar (HK); Esu Obu (EO)

Agenda

- Review notes: December 19, 2023
- 2026 Sunset: Activated charcoal (KH) - discuss review
- 2026 Sunset: Gelatin (KH) - discuss review
- Rye Pollen Extracts - petitioned (CD) - discuss/vote
- Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote
- 2026 Sunset: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD) - TR sufficiency
- Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss
- Additional Items
- Adjourn

Discussion

- **December 19, 2023 notes** were accepted as written
- **2026 Sunset: Activated charcoal (KH).** The lead summarized both the substance review and the TR, and the group discussed them. The HS requested a new TR, since the previous TAP was from 2002. The TR was found to be well written and comprehensive, specifically with regard to use of activated charcoal. The HS found the TR sufficient, and will submit the review for the Spring meeting.
- **2026 Sunset: Gelatin (KH).** The lead summarized the review of gelatin, noting the lack of organic gelatin. The HS included a question about barriers to production of organic gelatin, and the lead will complete the document and submit it for the Spring meeting.
- **Rye Pollen Extracts - petitioned (CD).** After a brief introduction by the lead, the group discussed the review for rye pollen extracts. The primary use is for vegan sweetener syrup, replacing honey from bees. The lead will make revisions based on the conversation, and will recirculate the document prior to submitting it to the NOP for the Spring 2024 meeting. The Subcommittee is not supportive of adding this to the National List. The group felt that the changes would not alter the document in such a way that it would change their vote, so moved to a vote on this call.

Motion to classify rye pollen extracts as agricultural

Motion by: CD

Seconded by: KS

Yes: 9 No: 0 Abstain: 0 Absent: 0 Recuse: 0

Motion to add rye pollen extracts to the NL

Motion by: CD

Seconded by: JD

Yes: 0 No: 9 Abstain: 0 Recuse: 0 Absent: 0

- **Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS).** The lead summarized the two reviews, which were combined into one document. Members discussed nano-particles, essentiality, and alternatives, such as chicory powder. Magnesium carbonate is allowed in many of the International Standards, and a member asked about equivalency agreements and how that impacts the use of

magnesium carbonate. A member added that the criteria to add substances to the NL should be a high bar, and members should take that into consideration with all substance reviews. Another member mentioned that magnesium carbonate was previously listed for use in made-with category of organic only, and it was removed. Additionally, the industry seems to have grown without it. The group discussed the questions that were part of the discussion document, and whether to include them again in the proposal. The lead will make some modifications and keep the questions, and the HS will vote on a future call.

- **2026 Sunset: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD).** The lead summarized the limited scope TR, which was focused on excluded methods. The TR was found sufficient, consistent, thorough, and well written. He also noted that the TR is broad enough to apply to other substances that are produced via fermentation. The group discussed the TR and its content, and the lead posed some questions for the group, which they may include in the Spring review. The three substances are scheduled to be reviewed on the February 6 call.
- **Research Priorities (DN, LP, All).** Deferred.
- **Additional Items.** None.
- **The meeting was adjourned.**

[Previous HS Notes](#)

Future call schedule (1st and 3rd Tuesdays 1:00 PM ET | 10:00 AM PT, except where noted).

December 19, 2023

2026 Sunset: Acids (Citric and Lactic) (NL) - discuss reviews

2026 Sunset: Pullulan (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Fish oil (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Seaweed, Pacific kombu (DN) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida) (DN) - discuss review

January 16, 2024

2026 Sunset: Activated charcoal (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Gelatin (KH) - discuss review

Rye Pollen Extracts - petitioned (CD) - discuss/vote

Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote

2026 Sunset: Enzymes, Microorganisms, Yeast (JD) - TR sufficiency

Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss

January 23, 2024

Magnesium Carbonate/Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide - petitioned (KS) - discuss/vote

2026 Sunset: Calcium chloride (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Tocopherols (KS) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium iodide (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Potassium phosphate (LP) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Sodium acid pyrophosphate (LP) - discuss review

February 6, 2024. Last call before proposals are due

2026 Sunset: Collagen gel (KH) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Magnesium sulfate (AJ) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Enzymes (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Microorganisms (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Yeast (JD) - discuss review

2026 Sunset: Perlite (KH) - discuss review

Research Priorities (DN, LP, All) - discuss

February 20, 2024

March 5, 2024

March 19, 2024
 April 2, 2024
 April 16, 2024

Work Agenda

*Highlight indicates discussion. *Highlight indicates action needed. *Highlight indicates review completion and/or vote.

Petitioned Substances

Substance	National List	Contact	Doc Type	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
Rye Pollen Extracts	205.606	CD	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 8.31.22. Petition suff. due 10.30.22. HS sent additional questions to the petitioner 10.4.22. Response due to HS ~1.15.23. Petitioner's response sent to HS 2.7.23. HS requested a TR 3.21.23. TR due Late October. TR sent to HS on 10.20.23. TR sufficiency due 12.19.23. TR found sufficient 12.5.23	12.5.23 1.16.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024
Magnesium Carbonate Hydroxide	205.605	KS	Proposal	Petition sent to HS 2.10.23. Petition suff. due 4.11.23. Petition found sufficient/ HS requested TR 3.21.23. TR sent to HS 8.31.23. Sufficiency due 10.30.23. TR found sufficient 9.19.23	12.5.23 1.16.24 1.23.24	Spr 2024

Other Projects

Project	Contact	Notes*	Scheduled/status	Target meeting
L-Malic acid reclassification	KS	Work agenda request 5.13.19. Sent to NOP 7.3.19. Approved by NOP 8.6.19. ON HOLD. Discussion doc. 2019 TR	9.19.23 TBD	TBD
Research Priorities	DN, LP, All	Spring 2024 list due to MS by Jan 16, 2024	12.5.23 12.19.23 2.6.24	Spr 2024

2026 Sunset Review

TR Requests (June 2023), Summary (Spr 2024), Review (Fall 2024)

Substance	National List	Contact	TR Request?	Notes*	Scheduled /status	Target meeting
Acids (Citric and Lactic)	205.605(a)(1)	NL	Y - Lmt'd scope (combine d with citrates?)	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 (Lactic acid, fermentd gluc) TAP: 1995 (Citric acid) TR: 2015 (Citric acid and salts) TR: 2015 (Lactic Acid, Sodium Lactate, and Potassium Lactate) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23.	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23 12.19.23	Summary: Spr 2024 Review: Fall 2024
Calcium chloride	205.605(a)(7)	KS	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Feb.	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	" "
Enzymes	205.605(a)(11)	JD	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 (Animal Enzymes) TR: 2015 (Animal Enzymes) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 1.16.24 2.6.24	" "
L-Malic acid	205.605(a)(16)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	" "
Magnesium sulfate	205.605(a)(18)	AJ	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due mid Jan 2024. Tr sent to HS 12.15.23. TR suff due 2.13.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	" "
Microorganisms	205.605(a)(19)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 2.6.24	" "

Perlite	205.605(a)(22)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1996 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “
Potassium iodide	205.605(a)(24)	LP	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 1995 TR: 2011 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Mar 2024	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Pullulan	205.605(a)(25)	DN	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2018 04/2019 recommendation to add 07/26/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Yeast	205.605(a)(30)	JD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2014 TR: 2014 (Microorganisms) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due early Dec. TR sent to HS 12.13.23. TR suff due 2.11.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 6.6.23 2.6.24	“ “
Activated charcoal	205.605(b)(2)	KH	Y	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Activated Carbon) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Nov. TR sent to HS 12.1.23. TR sufficiency due 1.30.24. TR found sufficient 1.16.24	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Ascorbic acid	205.605(b)(6)	NL	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2019 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 9.19.23	“ “
Calcium citrate	205.605(b)(7)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Collagen gel	205.605(b)(13)	KH	N	Sunset date: 7/26/2026 TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 06/25/2021, 86 FR 33479	3.21.23 4.4.23 2.6.24	“ “

Ferrous sulfate	205.605(b)(15)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 NVM 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Hydrogen peroxide	205.605(b)(17)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Crops) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Nutrient vitamins and minerals	205.605(b)(20)	AJ	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Peracetic acid/Peroxyacetic acid	205.605(b)(22)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 Handling 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “
Potassium citrate	205.605(b)(25)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Potassium phosphate	205.605(b)(28)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Sodium acid pyrophosphate	205.605(b)(30)	LP	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2010 (Sodium Acid Pyrophosphate) TR: 2016 (Phosphates) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 1.23.24	“ “
Sodium citrate	205.605(b)(31)	CD	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 (Citric Acid and Salts) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 Draft TR sent to HS 10.19.23. Sufficiency due 12.18.23. TR found sufficient 11.21.23	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.21.23	“ “
Tocopherols	205.605(b)(36)	KS	Y - Lmt'd Scope	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699 TR due late Feb 2024	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.23.24	“ “
Celery powder	205.606(c)	WT	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 11.7.23	“ “

Fish oil	205.606(f)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2015 TR: 2019 Fish-based fertilizers 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Gelatin	205.606(h)	KH	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TAP: 2002 (Gelatin) TR: 2019 (Collagen Gel, Gelatin, and Casings) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 1.16.24	“ “
Orange pulp, dried	205.606(m)	KS	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: NA 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 4.4.23 9.5.23	“ “
Seaweed, Pacific kombu	205.606(q)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “
Wakame seaweed (Undaria pinnatifida)	205.606(t)	DN	N	Sunset date: 9/12/2026 TR: 2016 (Marine Plants & Algae -Organic Production and Handling) 2019/Fall - Rec to Renew 08/03/2021 86 FR 41699	3.21.23 5.16.23 12.19.23	“ “

Milestones

Spring 2024 Milestones	Target dates (tentative)	Weeks PTM (prior to meeting)
NOP - Publish FRN, Open public comment	~Nov 17, 2023	16 -20
NOP - Draft Spring 2024 NOSB meeting tentative agenda	Feb 9, 2024	~ 10
NOSB - Spring 2024 proposals due to NOP	Feb 15, 2024	~ 9
NOP - Post proposals	Mar 5, 2024	7.5
Public comment closes	Apr 3, 2024	3.5
NOP - Send compiled public comments to NOSB	Apr 5, 2024	3
Public comment webinars	Apr 23 & 25, 2024	1
Spring 2024 NOSB meeting - Milwaukee, WI	Apr 29 - May 1, 2024	0
Final recommendations due	May 29, 2024	30 days post meeting